

ALIGNING ELA STANDARDS WITH ELD LANGUAGE STANDARDS, GRADES 9 - 12

Many states have developed two sets of standards: content learning standards for all students and ELD standards for English learners (EL). In order to support English learners' language acquisition and content learning, it is important that the language standards align with the content standards. Intentionally integrating language learning with content learning provides opportunities for more authentic and effective language and content learning experiences. However, teachers are cautioned to read the ELD standards with a critical eye to assess the skill level of linguistic and academic expectations.

Following is a guide and example of how to align English language arts (ELA) content and ELD standards in ways that assess presence and level of academic expectations for all students, including English learners at all points of language development from beginner to advanced.

From LESSON 1: ROUTINES OF READING, WRITING, THINKING, AND TALKING ABOUT PERSUASION

STANDARDS ADDRESSED IN THE LESSON

LINK: Aligning ELA Content and ELD Language Standards for Grades 9-12:

Identify the ELA Listening/Speaking standard addressed in the lesson. In this case, the ELA Listening and Speaking standard for lesson one of the Persuasion Unit is: **LS 1.1** Formulate judgments about the ideas under discussion and support those judgments with convincing evidence. Then, using the CA ELD Standards (<http://www.cde.ca.gov/be/st/ss/>), find the standards for this literacy task (Listening and Speaking) that are relevant to the content task.

The ELD Standards are organized according to two principles: English Language Fluency and Content area subcategories. The English language fluency ranges from 'Beginner,' 'Early Intermediate,' 'Intermediate,' 'Early Advanced,' to 'Advanced.' You will find that the Listening and Speaking ELD Standards are already aligned to the following English-language arts content subcategories: 'Comprehension,' 'Comprehension and Organization and Delivery of Oral Communication,' and 'Analysis and Evaluation of Oral and Media Communications and Comprehension.'

A careful look at the ELD standards reveals that they emphasize language use for social purposes while omitting academic standards for the EL student. For example, the following ELD standards, which align most closely with the ELA Listening and Speaking standards, do not require formulating judgments nor supplying evidence. The majority of the ELD standards, from beginner to advanced levels of proficiency, ask students to 'use simple sentences' and to

'identify' and 'restate' information. They fall short of mandating the necessary higher order cognitive engagement required to meet the ELA content standards. Therefore, we encourage teachers to read these standards with a critical eye. While it is important that instruction integrate content and language standards, it is detrimental to EL students' linguistic, academic, and social growth, to require less of them. We can develop students' academic skills, regardless of what language they speak, by developing rigorous standards and curricula, honoring and incorporating students' native language and culture, and holding all students to the same high standards.

| | ELD Beginner | ELD (Early-Advanced) Intermediate | ELD (Early-Advanced) Advanced |
|---|--|---|---|
| LS 1.1 Formulate judgments about the ideas under discussion and support those judgments with convincing evidence. | <p>Ask and answer questions by using simple sentences or phrases.</p> <p>Demonstrate comprehension of oral presentations and instructions through nonverbal responses.</p> <p>Respond with Simple words or phrases to questions about simple written texts.</p> <p>Orally identify types of media (e.g., magazine, documentary film, news report).</p> | <p>Ask and answer questions by using simple phrases or sentences.</p> <p>Restate and execute multi-step oral directions.</p> <p>Restate in simple sentences the main idea of oral presentations in subject-matter content.</p> <p>Listen attentively to stories and information and identify important details and concepts by using both verbal and nonverbal responses.</p> <p>Identify the main idea and some supporting details of oral presentations, familiar literature, and key concepts of subject-matter content.</p> | <p>Participate in and initiate more extended conversation with peers and adults on unfamiliar topics by asking and answering questions and restating and soliciting information.</p> <p>Demonstrate an understanding of figurative language and idiomatic expressions by responding to such expressions and using them appropriately.</p> |

The same exercise can be done for the ELA reading standard addressed in lesson one: **R 2.3** Generate relevant questions about readings on issues that can

be researched. The ELD reading standards are divided into the following subparts: 'Concepts about Print, Phonemic Awareness, and Vocabulary and Concept Development,' 'Phonemic Awareness and Decoding and Word Recognition,' 'Fluency and Systematic Vocabulary Development,' 'Reading Comprehension,' and 'Literary Response and Analysis.' For the purposes of this example, we have included a closer look at the 'Reading Comprehension' ELD standard and its subcategories.

One of the most striking features of these ELD reading standards is the emphasis on understanding 'work related activities' and 'filling out simple applications.' A glaring omission is the expectation that high school EL students engage in academic texts that are grade and language appropriate. The comprehension standards state that EL students should be able to 'explain...directions for using a simple mechanical device' and develop other 'workplace' skills, implying a vocational educational emphasis that undermines the focus on academic teaching and learning.

The ELD standards that are most relevant to the R 2.3 ELA content standards are in bold. Teachers should note that the tasks require students to identify or categorize bits of information, not to generate their own questions for further research. Again, we see that the standards for EL students do not require higher order cognitive engagement with grade-appropriate content. These standards, through their omission of academic expectations, isolate EL students academically and socially from the academic expectations of their English-speaking peers. The consequence of these academic omissions can be and has been EL students' non-participation in rigorous classroom learning.

| R 2.3 Generate relevant questions about readings on issues that can be researched. | ELD Beginner | Intermediate ELD Level | Advanced ELD Level |
|---|--|---|--|
| Comprehension | Understand and follow simple multiple-step oral directions for classroom or work-related activities. | Understand and orally explain most multiple-step directions for using a simple mechanical device and filling out simple applications. | Apply knowledge of language to achieve comprehension of informational materials, literary text, and text in content areas. |
| Comprehension and Analysis of Grade-Level | Recognize a few specific facts in | In detailed sentences, identify | Analyze the features and |

| | | | |
|--|---|--|---|
| <p>Appropriate Text</p> | <p>familiar expository texts, such as consumer in detailed sentences identify orally two to three examples of Analyze the features and rhetorical devices of different types of public documents publications, workplace documents, and content area texts.</p> <p>Orally identify the main ideas and some details of familiar literature and informational materials/public documents (e.g., newspaper, brochure) by using key words or phrases.</p> <p>Point out text features, such as The title, table of contents, and chapter headings.</p> | <p>orally two to three examples of how clarity of text is affected by the repetition of important ideas and by syntax.</p> <p>Present a brief Report that verifies and clarifies facts in two to three forms of expository text.</p> <p>Read text and use detailed sentences to identify orally the main ideas and use them to make predictions about informational text, literary text, and text in content areas.</p> | <p>rhetorical devices of different types of public documents and the way authors use those features and devices.</p> |
| <p>Structural Features of Informational Materials</p> | <p>Identify the vocabulary, syntax, and grammar used in public and workplace documents (e.g., speeches, debates, manuals, and contracts).</p> | <p>Read workplace documents and orally identify the structure and format (e.g., graphics and headers) and give one brief example of how the author uses the feature to achieve his or her purpose. Read and use</p> | <p>Prepare oral and written reports that evaluate the credibility of an author's argument or defense of a claim by critiquing the relationship between generalizations</p> |

| | | | |
|---|--|---|--|
| | | <p>simple sentences to identify orally the features and the rhetorical devices of simple excerpts of public and workplace documents and content area texts.</p> | <p>and evidence. Prepare a bibliography for the report. Prepare a brief research or synthesizing paper in a content area and analyze ideas from several sources to present a coherent argument or conclusion arranged in the proper format, including a bibliography.</p> |
| <p>Comprehension and Analysis of Grade-Level-Appropriate Text and Expository Critique</p> | | <p>Listen to an excerpt from a brief political speech and give an oral critique of the author's evidence by using simple sentences.</p> | <p>Analyze how clarity is affected by patterns of organization, hierarchical structures, repetition of key ideas, syntax, and word choice in texts across content areas.</p> |